| **Student Name:** Giselle | P1 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments:  Note: Speaking time for today is 5 minutes!   * I think that the hook content was fine, but it definitely should have had a much higher manner attached to it; try to make it seem urgent! * Good eye contact and hand gestures! Keep this part up. * When you suggest that you want to suspend labour unions, you need to be very clear with what exactly the direct metrics (Or Standards) to suspend a labour union is, as well as when you will bring the unions back! * I think that before going into specific scenarios (Like the doctors in the UK), you want to probably give me some picture of how exactly we end up in an economical crisis; what exactly is the conditions during this time? Why are strikes so damaging in this context? * In addition to the above, you really want to make sure that you are centering and talking about the debate in the context that it is set in; e.g., if people aren’t going to work during an economic crisis, they might also lose their livelihoods, etc. * Try to make sure that you are also considering what the other side’s perspective is likely to be; their perspective is likely to be one whereby you need to be protected from the corporate interests and or capitalism; how do you assure that things will be fair and safe in this scenario? * Good weighing about why the average person is more important; you can go further to say that workers have likely committed or at the very least consented to the jobs they are doing - this doesn’t apply for regular civilians who don’t have much of a choice.   Speaking time: 05:34.87, good work! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Alvina O1 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments:  Note: Speaking time today is 5 minutes.   * Good content at the start, but I think you could have sounded a lot more urgent and or desperate! This is a tough fight you’re dealing with. * Good position that you are going to strengthen the unions; how might you do this and what could this look like? * Good structuring and flowing; definitions are fine - but I think you want to also explore why these economic crises happen - this can help you to identify if these crises will be short term, etc! * Why might the Government and or a business treat workers this way? You suggest that they will be treated badly and or have a pretty rough time during this time. Why is that true? * I’m not sure about the silent protest argument. The reason is because presumably, you want to prevent situations where workers do not work at full level. This is pretty much worse in a world where people are striking; so it feels like you are actively supporting the other side here! (Or at least you are opening yourself up to attacks.) * What types of policies are these unions likely to pursue in your world? Try to make sure to display and show that these unions are reasonable; you don't want it to look like the unions will make extreme demands during this time! You can say things like unions are also reasonable and do not wish to see their workers fired. * Try to extract the harm of not being able to protest; how exactly would this impact things like working conditions, etc?   Speaking time: 05:32.47, good work! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Kyle P2 |
| --- |

| Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments:  Note: Speaking time today is 5 minutes.   * Nice tone and intonation! Try to make sure that you are maintaining eye contact though. Hand gestures! * Don’t be thrown off by what’s happening around you - focus only on yourself! * Rebuttal; I think that a better rebuttal might be one that proves that negotiations are going to go badly for the first speaker; this is because it isn’t very clear to me as to why certain people will feel compelled to not negotiate and or cause negotiations to fail! * I think that I could have used some more details on what exactly this crisis looks like and how it impacts people; this can be used to boost your analysis! * Surge in strikes; I think you could actually tell me why this happens first - and try to focus it on economics! How might this hurt the recovery of the economy?   Speaking time: 03:24.81, good work! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Louca O2 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments:  Speaking time:   * Nice start and hook Louca! Good energy. * I like the angle that a ton of people are likely to end up in prison; perhaps you can say that strikes are at the very least quite orderly and organised - if we take this away from people, they have a high chance of becoming violent and rioting, etc. * I like the angle you took about how people need to defend themselves from their employers; but try to give me the context here first. This means that you gotta tell me how and why employers would even want to try to mess with their workers to begin with! What might they be gaining? * When you suggest that labour unions are going to keep things “Safe”, what exactly do you mean by this? Try to make sure that you are quantifying this as its one of your main impacts! * Try to give me multiple reasons for why an argument is true; this helps to extend your speaking time quite a bit! * Try to make sure that you explaining why the majority matters; for example, it’s one thing to be utilitarin, but you gotta explain why this is the correct thing to do! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Amanda P3 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments:  Speaking time: 05:02.71, good work!   * Nice hook! I think you made it quite clear to me that this was a terrible situation and or condition for people to be in. I think you could actually go further to tell me how and why emergency times justify harsh actions. * I think that you first can start by rebutting and explaining that employers are likely to be quite reasonable; this means that employers are not necessarily in a position to mess with their staff, as a lack of staff also means that you do not have any space to make more money. This at least sets the stage to make the debate a lot fairer to yourself! * I think the 9/11 example was good, but you could have got there a lot faster. I think you can also extract a key aspect here; which is that sometimes to save a company we need to make sure that we have the ability to keep costs at a minimum. So, sometimes, a company might need to fire people off to keep themselves a float. * I think Louca is fair when they ask about how exactly workers will be protected in this scenario. But, you could actually say that 1. Companies have an incentive to keep their workers 2. Laws still apply - that means that companies cannot do things like changing your compensation, etc, without strict requirements being met first. * I think that the speech assumes that unions will be taking the most intense and extreme measures of striking, etc. Perhaps you want to start by talking about how unions will likely get there first? |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Ethan O3 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments: Amanda O3  Speaking time: 04:45.19, good work!  Note: Speaking time today is 5 minutes.   * I think that you could have been a lot more confident sounding today; the speech felt a bit underwhelming * I like that you suggested that strikes are not the norm, rather the last resort. I think that for this to work, you could firstly tell me why it’s quite likely for the companies and or unions to compromise - it’s not that they want to do the worst potential things! * I wasn’t too sure about the Warner Act, as it didn’t seem as relevant to the situation. * Try to make sure that you are actively moving your hands; I want to see you take up a bit more of a presence as you are speaking! * For clashes, I think that you need to make sure that you are actively telling me how to judge the debate (Meaning, what exactly is and is not important?) first before getting into the clashes. * A lot of the clash navigation was based on rebuttals; but remember that you’re also meant to compare and explain why you are more valuable! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Ashley P4 |
| --- |

| **Motion: THW suspend labour unions in times of economic crisis.** |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher Comments: Ashley P4  Speaking time: 06:01.10, good work!  Note: Speaking time today is 5 minutes.   * Nice hook! * I like the framing that you did in the beginning about how this is actually unfair to those who need it the most; but this assumes that the workers are not important too! So, it may have been a lot more useful for you to do the comparison there and then as to why the public matters more. * Remember to be strategic with your responses; the most compelling argument coming from the other side is that strikes are a last resort compared to something that people will definitely and firstly do. Try to make sure to deal with this picture first! * I think that a lot of the arguments assume a scenario where someone is a critical worker and therefore endangers people; but what about scenarios like factory workers striking? How do you deal with this specific scenario? The point is, try to make sure that you are not just focusing on one scenario as it may be convenient! * It would be good if you were to provide multiple reasons to me as to why it is the case that your side is either more truthful or impactful; these are the main areas where you win the clash! * Try to bring up the impacts of an economy slowing down via strikes!! Does this mean less jobs for the average person, etc? |
| --- |